

San Francisco Bay Conservation and Development Commission

455 Golden Gate Avenue, Suite 10600, San Francisco, California 94102 tel 415 352 3600 fax 415 352 3606

December 9, 2016

TO: All Commissioners and Alternates

FROM: Lawrence J. Goldzband, Executive Director (415/352-3653; larry.goldzband@bcdc.ca.gov)

Sharon Louie, Director, Administrative & Technology Services (415/352-3638; sharon.louie@bcdc.ca.gov)

SUBJECT: Draft Minutes of December 1, 2016 Commission Meeting

1. Call to Order. The meeting was called to order by Chair Wasserman at the Bay Area Metro Center, 375 Beale Street, Yerba Buena Room, First Floor, San Francisco, California at 1:08 p.m.

2. Roll Call. Present were: Chair Wasserman, Vice Chair Halsted, Commissioners Addiego, Bates (represented by Alternate Butt), Chan (Represented by Alternate Gilmore), DeLaRosa (represented by Alternate Jahns), Gibbs (arrived at 1:14 p.m.), McGrath, Nelson, Pine, Sartipi (represented by Alternate McElhinney (arrived at 1:14 p.m.), Sears, Spering (represented by Alternate Vasquez), Techel, Ziegler (represented by Alternate Brush) and Zwissler.

Chair Wasserman announced that a quorum was present.

Not present were Commissioners: Santa Clara County (Cortese), Department of Finance (Finn), Contra Costa County (Gioia), Sonoma County (Gorin), U.S. Army Corps of Engineers (Hicks), City and County of San Francisco (Kim), State Lands Commission (Lucchesi), Governor (Randolph), Napa County (Wagenknecht).

Chair Wasserman delivered a welcome: I would like to take a moment to welcome all of you to our new meeting space at 375 Beale Street. Most of our meetings in the future will be held here, although in the board room across the hall. Please note where the emergency exits are; the two obvious doors. There is a third one that is the green exit sign. We request that you limit your Wi-Fi use to viewing Commission materials.

3. Public Comment Period. Chair Wasserman called for public comment on subjects that were not on the agenda.

Louis Blumberg addressed the Commission: I direct the California Climate Change Program for the Nature Conservancy. My office is two blocks down on Beale.

I have some comments on the specific recommendations that I will save for later as I was not quite clear on the process. I do have some general comments as well.

info@bcdc.ca.gov | www.bcdc.ca.gov
State of California | Edmund G. Brown, Jr. — Governor



BCDC MINUTES
December 1, 2016

I am pleased that you are continuing to explore this issue of sea level rise. Since you adopted your policy on sea level rise in October of 2011 there has been significant progress on developing policy and guidance in the state of California as well as beyond.

I wanted to urge you that whatever you do through this process that what you do is aligned with what has happened.

I would point to Governor Brown's executive order of April 2015 that sets out direction on the mandate for agencies to consider climate change in all of their plans in investments; also to give priority to natural infrastructure to protect the most vulnerable communities and so forth. And that policy and the executive order was picked up by the Legislature and there were three bills that were passed and signed into law that deal with climate change and resiliency and promoting climate-resilient activities at three scales; at the state scale, at the regional scale as well as the local scale.

In those policies as well there is direction and guidance that is directly germane to what you are doing.

The state has had a continuing planning process called *Safeguarding California*. There have been updates and there is an implementation plan. There is a focus on oceans and sea level rise which should also inform your work.

I urge you to integrate these plans into what you are doing. I would also urge you that this is the time to consider revising your sea level rise policy from 2011.

The material is there and it is time for BCDC to step up and lead and revisit the overarching policy.

Chair Wasserman moved to Approval of the Minutes.

4. Approval of Minutes of the November 17, 2016 Meeting. Chair Wasserman asked for a motion and a second to adopt the minutes of November 17, 2016.

MOTION: Commissioner Nelson moved approval of the Minutes, seconded by Commissioner Zwissler.

VOTE: The motion carried with a vote of 16-0-0 with Commissioners Addiego, Butt, Gilmore, Jahns, Gibbs, McGrath, Nelson, Pine, McElhinney, Sears, Vasquez, Techel, Brush, Zwissler, Vice Chair Halsted and Chair Wasserman voting, "YES", no "NO", votes and no abstentions.

5. Report of the Chair. Chair Wasserman reported on the following:

a. **New Business.** Is there any new business that any Commissioner would like to advance for our next agendas? (No comments were voiced)

We did receive by email the story in the New York Times about vulnerable cities. There are several messages to take from that. The two good messages are the issue is continuing to gain attention, nationally and at local levels. This is very important. The other good news is that they are focusing locally in looking at real problems and listing the most vulnerable cities. The good news is we are not on that list. The bad news is we are not on that list.

I suspect that is in part because of a certain eastern-centric, myopic view of journalists and maybe even of some scientists. The problems on the East Coast are somewhat different than ours. In terms of dangers to the built and the critical natural environment for the health of our Bay; we are very significantly vulnerable to rising sea level.

That is why I am so pleased to see so many people here many of whom have attended our prior workshops. Continuity in this is important but there are some new faces and that is good as well.

We do need to keep this issue in the forefront particularly because given what has been happening for a long time in Congress as well as what has happened more recently; there is not going to be a whole lot of help coming to us from Washington. We are going to have to focus locally and as with many other things we are going to have to hunker down, focus locally and figure out how to muster our resources and use them effectively. That is what this workshop is going to do.

b. **Next BCDC Meeting.** Our next meeting will be December 15th in the Board Room Right across the hall here at 375 Beale. We expect to take up the following matters:

- (1) A contract for updating our Strategic Plan
- (2) Adopting the 2015 Annual Report
- (3) A staff briefing on the outcome of today's workshop.
- (4) A staff briefing on the Contra Costa County ART Project.

c. **Ex-Parte Communications.** That completes my report. If any Commissioner wishes to put an ex-parte communication on the record they may do so at this time. Again, this concerns adjudicatory matters not planning matters. (No comments were voiced)

d. **Executive Director's Report.** Seeing none we can move on.

Chair Wasserman moved to the Executive Director's Report.

6. Report of the Executive Director. Executive Director Goldzband reported: It is absolutely great to be in this new building. I want to thank Steve Heminger of MTC and Jack Broadbent of the Air District for inviting us in, and Teri Green, who runs the Bay Area Headquarters Authority, for being such great future co-locators and landlords. One thing you should know is that the facility is a former tank factory and major post office facility. Of course, that reminds me of what Johnny Carson always used to say on the Monday after Thanksgiving -- "Mail your packages early so the post office can lose them in time for Christmas."

First, Wendy Goodfriend, one of the three founding members of the Adapting to Rising Tides Program, will be leaving the Commission staff in mid-December to join the City and County of San Francisco's Department of the Environment where she will work on climate programs. Wendy has led so many important efforts for BCDC during her seven years with us, including the Corte Madera Baylands and the Tidal Creeks and Flood Channels projects, as well as the ART Program Project in Contra Costa County.

In addition she has been invaluable to those of us who are not scientists because she can explain things so well. We shall miss Wendy but she will not be very far away. We hope to continue to collaborate with her. You will see her swan song in two weeks when, on her last day with us, she'll regale you with the success story that is the Contra Costa ART Project.

On a happier note, you might remember that BCDC began a Digitization Project a few years ago with a small grant to scan our paper permit files. During that Phase I, BCDC was able to scan all of its executed originals and make them available online internally. About six weeks ago, thanks to another grant from CIAP, the Coastal Impact Assistance Program, which are federal funds from offshore energy development that are granted through the state Natural Resources Agency, BCDC began Phase II of the Digitization Project. So far we have shipped 270 boxes of Major Permits and Consistency Determinations to our scanning and uploading vendor. By year's end we plan to ship another 100 boxes of permit files including Administrative, Marsh Development and Region-wide Permits. Digitizing these records not only preserves them and makes them accessible online internally through a database, but it also increases our ability to find information as it allows us to search by keyword and use advanced search options. Furthermore, it reduces our onsite storage costs as we will now be able to store these records offsite at the State Records Center. This is a big effort and it takes an awful lot of manpower and patience to go through these types of records which are so old. Christine Nutile who is our semi-new Records Manager is spearheading the project and she is in the back of the room. I want to thank all of our office techs for their efforts.

That completes my report Chair Wasserman and I am happy to answer any questions anybody may have.

Chair Wasserman asked: Any questions for the Executive Director? (No comments were voiced)

7. Consideration of Administrative Matters. Chair Wasserman announced: I see no questions and we will move on to Consideration of Administrative Matters. We have received a report of the administrative actions. Does anybody have any questions about them? (No comments were voiced) The next item is Adjournment; I will take a motion to adjourn.

8. Adjournment. Upon motion by Commissioner Nelson, seconded by Commissioner Sears, the Commission meeting was adjourned at 1:21 p.m.